

IN THE HIGH COURT OF SINDH AT KARACHI

SUIT NO.1243/2015

Plaintiffs : Mashal Welfare Foundation and another,

Defendants : The Province of Sindh and others,

.....

Date of hearing : 23.11.2020, 11.01.2021 & 05.03.2021

Date of announcement : 06.05.2021.

.....

A P P E A R A N C E :

Raja Qasit Nawaz, advocate for plaintiff.

Mr. Nasrullah Korai, advocate for Intervener.

Malik Altaf Jawed and Mr. Muhammad Nasir advocates for S.E.F.

Dr. Iqbal Hussain Durrani, Chairman Education Committee.

Mr. Ahmed Bux Narejo, Secretary School(s) Education .

Mr. Faqeer Muhammad Lakho, Additional Secretary, Colleges.

Dr. Saeed Ahmed Qureshi, focal person to Chief Secretary.

Mr. Sikandar Hassan, Deputy Secretary (Legal), Finance Department.

ORDER

SALAHUDDIN PANHWAR, J. While finding serious flaws in public education sector in the Province, this Court directed the Chief Secretary Sindh to constitute a high powered Education Committee under the Chairmanship of Dr. Iqbal Hussain Durrani, Ex-Federal Secretary, so as to have something which could help the *public education system* in achieving what it **was** meant. Worth appreciating that while appreciating the orders of this Court, the Govt. of Sindh *did* issue the notifications of constitution of Committee and Sub-Committee for purpose of improving the standard of the education in *public sector*. I am conscious of the fact that '*the castles are not built in one day*' nor a collapsing system can be reshaped in days but proper planning and *true* implementation thereof is the only way of

rectification and improvement. Worth adding that such constituted committee, for the first time, included all stake-holder(s) and even the help of the *educationalists/experts* were taken for preparing '*final report*' so as to find out *lacking* and ways to over-come the same. With worth appreciating *hectic* efforts of Education Committee headed by Dr. Iqbal Hussain Durrani and Sub-Committee(s), the final report was submitted on 26.03.2021. The '*acknowledgment*', detailed in such final report, being relevant to, *prima facie*, show back-ground thereof, is referred in terms of ToRs:-

“Working on any policy document is always a taxing job and undoubtedly development of this **multi-layered education reform agenda** was not possible without the team of **diverse and committed professionals**, who prepared background papers and other commissioned inputs to inform the analysis. We would like to express our gratitude to the Members of the Core Committee, Chairmen and Members of the Sub-Committees.

The Sub-Committees played a key role in providing guidance and support at all stages of the Report's cycle and finally preparing think-pieces. We would like to thank each of its members for their time, energy and enthusiasm. Particular thanks go to the Chair of the Sub-Committees: Dr. Almina Pardhan, Mr. Ahmed Bukhsh Narejo, Mr. Baqar Abbas Naqvi, Dr. Saeeduddin, Dr. Abdul Qadeer Rajput, Dr. Madad Ali Shah, Dr. Muhammad Memon, Dr. Sheerin Narejo, Dr. Parveen Munshi, Mr. Abdul Kabir Kazi and Dr. Sarosh Lodhi.

Special thanks go to members of the expert panel, including Prof. Dr. Muhammad Memon, Dr. Fouzia Khan, Mr. Asadullah Abro, Prof. Dr. Tayyaba Zarif and the report consolidation team; Mr. Aamir Latif Siddiqui, Mr. Zahid Abbas Jatoy and Mr. Mubashir Mirza. We would like to extend our thanks to Mr. Ahmed Bukhsh Narejo, Secretary Education and Literacy Department for facilitating and providing support for compilation of this report.

The guiding principles of this report are derived from the terms of references provided by the Honourable High Court of Sindh. We are very grateful to the Honourable Court for the guidance and support provided during various proceedings.

2. The '*back-ground*', detailed in the report, does affirm the fact that public education system was / is requiring comprehensive work towards reformation / improvement thereof. The same (report) reads as:-

Following the submission of the progress reports to the Honourable High Court of Sindh dated 23-11-2020 and 11.1.2021, the report & review committees finalized the remaining five reports of the sub-committees.

The reports of all the 11 sub-committees; Early Childhood Education (ECE); Elementary Education (Class I-VIII); Secondary and Higher Secondary Education (Class IX-XII); School Examination (Class IX-XII); Higher Education; Technical and Vocational Education; Teacher Education & Continuous Professional Development; Private Education; Non-Formal / Adult Education; Public Private Partnership (PPP) and Libraries, have been signed by the Chairpersons of the respective sub committees (**Annexure-I**). The reports have been thoroughly examined specially with reference to the Honourable Court's orders.

Pakistan has, in general, been bracing a long-time crisis of access, quality and governance in education sector. Sindh, once a flag bearer in education and learning indicators, is of no exemption in bracing **the education crisis of even more deteriorating situation than other provinces of the country.** After 18th constitutional amendment, education becomes the provincial chapter for policy, planning and execution. The provincial government has introduced several reforms and initiatives, mainly relating to legislation, policy and planning and enhancing financial resources etc. to turn around the situation of access, quality and governance in education sector in Sindh, but after a decade of having education as the provincial subject and subsequent efforts made by the provincial government in the education sector, **there is much desired to be done for improvement in each sub-sector and thematic areas.**

On the directions of the Honourable High Court of Sindh that also showed its concern about the continuously deteriorating situation, particularly in public sector education in Sindh, the provincial government constituted a committee comprising heads of departments, universities, boards, allied institutes and education experts to frame a policy **of bringing improvement in public education sector.** The committee had a wide range of consultations by adopting/ expanding representation of different sections of the community and the society to be considered relevant stakeholders involved in education sector in Sindh. A consensus is being formulated for framing the provincial education policy framework on the basis of; Sub-sectoral and Thematic areas i.e. Early Childhood Education (ECE); Elementary Education (Class I-VIII); Secondary and Higher Secondary Education (Class IX-XII); School Examination (Class IX-XII); Higher Education; Technical and Vocational Education; Teacher Education & Continuous Professional Development; Private Education; Non-Formal/ Adult Education; Public Private Partnership (PPP) and Libraries. Each sub-sector envisages contextual course of cross-cutting themes such as vision, access, equity, quality, management and governance, accreditation and certification, institutional collaboration and network and integration of technology.

Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives (Remember, Understand, Apply, Analyze, Evaluate, Create) along with a matrix of cross-cutting themes (**Annexure-II**); and, Normative/ Social Learning Framework along with 21st Century Learning Framework; Sustainable Development Goals 2030; Fourth Industrial Revolution; Provincial Acts (Curriculum Standards, Private Education, SHEC, STEDA, PPP, Free & Compulsory Education); School Education Sector Plan (2019-2024); Policies (ECCE, CPD, NFE); National Professional Standards for Teachers; Projects (ADB Assisted School Education Project and Others); and National Accreditation Standards for Teacher Education, etc. "

3. The above, *prima facie*, shows that it (report-work) was not confined to early education *only* but all kind(s) of educational institution(s) from *early Childhood Education (ECE)* to *Higher Education, libraries* as well *Technical &*

Vocational Education were examined which, I would say, was / is the demand of Article 37 of the Constitution. The work of the Committee as well that of its sub-committee(s) was / is aimed to build our nation because *“knowledge is power. Information is liberating. Education is premises of progress, in every society, in every family (Kofi Annan).* I believe it is not wise to stick with faults of past but better to work on rectification rather than moaning on faults of past. **“What you do today can improve all your tomorrows” (Ralph Marston).** The work is really admirable hence the same needs to be made part of today, particularly those pointing way-outs of all stages of our educational system.

4. The report shows that our educational system consists of eleven (11) sub-sectoral or thematic areas. Each of them has been defined under *Executive Summary* head as:-

5. **Early Childhood Education (ECE)**

The pre-primary education is acknowledged as *key-means* so as to develop a relation between child with schooling or books. The report shows recognition and introduction of different programmes and policies for ECE which, however, could not bring the desired result, therefore, report while dealing with such sub-sector suggests as:-

“To cope these challenges, the report outlines policy recommendations for ECE in public school system in Sindh; i) By 2030, ensuring equitable and adequate provision of school infrastructure with all ECE resource in all public primary schools and primary sections of post-primary schools, ii) Katchi classes to be gradually transformed into ECE in all public primary schools and primary sections of post-primary schools and no ‘katchi’ informal class after 2025, iii) ECE and/or ‘katchi’ students to formally be admitted and G.R. number be issued accordingly, iv) learning material and resources to be provided for both teachers and students in accordance with needs of ECE curriculum, v) ensuring qualified and dedicated human resource for teaching ECE in public primary schools and sections and relevant SNE for ECE human resource will gradually be increased annually, vi) **ECE teachers’ courses to be introduced in accordance with ECE policy, standards and curriculum,** vii) ECE recruitment policy also be reviewed in accordance with new ECE teachers’ course/ certificates, viii) ensuring equitable access for specialized ECE course/ certificates all across the province as per market demand and ix) inter-departmental committee will be constituted for implementation of ECCE policy in Sindh”

Who can deny the importance of ECE because such age is the *foundation* of a superstructure which, *earlier*, known as ‘*tarbiat/training*’, therefore, inclusion of ECE in the report shows the seriousness thereof as well that of the Committee towards the assigned job.

6. Elementary Education (Class I-VIII)

This part shows number of Act (s) and policies, so passed for satisfying the constitutional obligations within meaning of Article 25-A of Constitution which could be appreciable only if satisfy the desired objects. While detailing all such positive steps, the Committee concludes as:-

“...The level of educational achievement in Sindh is overall low with persisting concerns about the quality of education. **Student learning outcomes, tested through various assessments across grades, are poor.** Teaching in the classroom mostly uses the rote memory approach, reducing the opportunity for higher order thinking to develop among children. **Nonetheless, education outcomes do not appear to have improved significantly.** Unless the system has the ability to implement, planning will not deliver the desired results. The sub-committee identifies key challenges as lack of key school-level ingredients for learning due to no use of Bloom Taxonomy of Learning Behaviours in teaching learning process; poor quality of teaching; large number of out-of-school children; multi-grade teaching; low school availability beyond primary education; missing basic facilities along with less financial allocation for the regular repair and maintenance of the schools; low participation and retention; insufficient, unreliable and scarcity of the education data (generally public sector school education data is available) for planning; less focused demand-side initiatives; GPI less than 1; urban rural disparity; low educational achievement of students with evidently low performance in language, mathematics and science at grade 5 and 8; teaching methods are often teacher-centered; no priority given to teacher education programs in recruitment process; corporal punishment; absence of inclusive education environment; lack of budget for the provision of teaching learning material in the schools; lack of continuous professional development of teachers; no plan or strategy for reducing dropout; and lack of dedicated unit to carry out strategic planning, M&E, and research functions. Based on gaps and challenges, the sub-committee proposes policy recommendations with a need to develop a comprehensive plan for increasing access to education beyond the primary level, reducing multi-grade teaching, decreasing dropout ratio and providing missing facilities along with provision of regular budgets for repair and maintenance. The committee also recommends to use Bloom Taxonomy of Learning Behaviours for the whole teaching learning process. Other key recommendations include establishment of a **comprehensive integrated database system; Data collection of education indicators annually as well as real time basis; introduction of student tracking IDs; school infrastructure to meet evidence-based needs and ensure learning friendly environment; removal of redundancies from the system and also consolidate single room schools; meritorious recruitment of qualified teachers; Continuous Professional Development framework for teachers, head-teachers and administrators; Student curriculums will be improved with focus on local needs and global trends, inclusive education and life skills, gender equality, cultural diversity and citizenship; Provision of textbooks and learning materials based on the revised curriculum in appropriate languages; teacher education curriculum and programs will be aligned with student curriculum; school specific student assessment and**

reporting system; management mechanisms for performance and accountability of education system as well as personnel; improved efficacy and expansion of the EMO model; demand side incentive will be developed; a media awareness campaign for prohibiting corporal punishment, as per Sindh Prohibition of Corporal Punishment Act 2016; integrated strategy for bringing out of school children into formal education stream; strategy for enhancing capacity of teacher education institutes to provide professional and qualified teachers in accordance with market demand; implementation of CPD Strategic Plan for in-service teachers; and ensuring inclusive education environment in schools.

7. I am conscious of the fact that unless the fault is known and acknowledged there can be no possibility of its being removed / corrected. Since, the Committee, *prima facie*, not only found lacking but also came forward with ways-out, therefore, it is the time to believe that same shall, in-sha-Allah bring fruits.

Secondary/Higher Secondary Education (Class IX-XII)

For this, the Committee finds a:-

.....The sub-committee identifies key challenges as low enrolment due to less number of schools; outdated infrastructure along with budgetary and bureaucratic constraints; lack of integration of use of technology in teaching and learning process; disparities of access to education at gender, class, health levels; curriculum yet to be reviewed on basis of Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives along with transformation of all textbooks accordingly; absence of well-defined and easily understandable teachers' guide; unavailability of CPD mechanism for education reforms and initiatives; ineffective educational planning; absence of quality assurance mechanism and process at all levels; and no real/ modern assessment techniques and tools. The sub-committee also proposes key recommendations which include upgrading schools to sufficient level for increase in number of post-primary schools; integrating technology in academic and administrative matters; training of teachers' and linking promotion with completion of training; introducing a uniform and comprehensive policy for Quality Assurances; improving infrastructure of existing schools; rationalizing the existing staff and ensuring use of SESLOAF trained teachers for training of assessment.

8. School Examination (Class IX-XII)

Examination, I shall insist, was / is the ultimate test of knowing what *really* has been delivered. This, however, was never worked as should have been done hence lacking *normally* result in despair for those who strive hard because possibilities of cheating and other *ill* means allow big-pockets to tamper the merit. The report acknowledges as:-

“Examination is an integral part and a driving force of education system to assess students' academic achievements, evaluate system performance and provide insight for further improvement of teaching learning process. Examination system has changed substantially across the globe, however, it has not changed much in our context. It is also unfortunate that this sub-sector has never been made part of several education reform and initiatives taken by provincial and/or federal governments. **As a result, the existing examination system has become stagnant and various critics indicate that the examination has promoted teacher-centric pedagogies, rote memorization, selective study of examination subjects, and cheating**

and other malpractices in examination. Hence, it necessitates that the examination system must be transformed through automation to make it credible and align with the national and global educational standards underlying the learning framework of 21st Century and Sustainable Development Goals 2030. The report prepared by sub-committee narrates gaps and challenges of school examination system as a) lack of credibility and quality of examination; b) absence of quality assurance and control system/manual for both examination and affiliation of schools and colleges; c) lack of expertise for paper setting and moderating question papers; d) lack of items bank; e) question papers are set from the textbooks rather than the curriculum; f) lack of authentic assessment; g) ineffective marking key without scoring rubrics; h) lack of syllabus indicating specification of test based on the Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives; i) shortage of qualified staff, especially in the area of research and evaluation; j) limited control on examination centres; k) reluctance of senior teaching staff as examiners, head examiners and invigilators; l) external interference in the examination centres; m) absence of knowledge-based question papers; n) lack of integration of technology in examination; o) use of cheating and malpractice in examination; p) lack of transparency in examination results; and q) financial crisis due to non-reimbursement of exempted fees to the Educational Boards. The report also proposes policy direction to improve school examination system based on Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives. The policy directions emphasizes the need of **transformation of examination system to be based on automation framework through effective integration of technology with policy goals including a) assessing students' higher order of cognitive skills; b) conducting curriculum-based examination; c) changing pattern of question papers; d) conducting fair and transparent examination; e) developing robust marking scheme and scoring rubrics; f) preparing transparent examination results, and g) conducting research in examination.** The report provides recommendations (short-term and long-term) to bring reforms in school examination system. The short-term recommendations include a) to fill up vacant posts of Secretaries and Controller of Examinations immediately; to make the Board financially sustainable c) to develop Quality Assurance System (QAS) for examinations and assessment; d) to use **Enterprise Resource Planning (ERP)** to automate all functions of the Boards to enhance their institutional efficiency; e) to introduce online services including enrolment forms, examination forms etc.; f) to revise question papers structure/pattern with **MCQs 30%**, Constructed Response Questions (CRQs) / Short Questions 30%, Extended Response Questions- ERPs) / **Long Questions 40% weightage**; g) to revise question papers based on knowledge (50%), Understanding (20%), and Application/Critical Thinking Skills (30%), with flexibility of change in the ratio from subject to subject and the extent of the higher order of cognitive skills; h) to use Optical Mark Recognition (OMR) to assess MCQs; i) to explore the opportunity for conducting examination in evening to avoid interruption in teaching and learning process; i) **to use of CCTV Cameras for effective conduct of examination; j) to conduct training for teachers to develop items bank; k) to build institutional capacity of Board staff, paper setters, moderators and other examination staff for managing the examinations effectively and making assessment more valid and reliable; l) to make compulsory duty of examination and assessment staff; and to enhance security system to curb cheating and other malpractices in examination.** The long-term recommendations include introduction of automation system in examination; establishment of IT laboratory with qualified IT staff; implementation of curriculum-based examination; development of central items bank and rubrics for making assessment authentic; use of e-marking for assessment of CRQ/short and ERQ/long answers; revival of research sections in the Boards for analysis of results etc.; capacity building and professional development of teachers, staff and others related to examination matters; development of online facilitation system which includes a dash board for facilitation, and verification of documents etc. and appointment of professional staff dealing with the automation of examination system.

A sense of fair and transparent *examination system* shall surely ensure competition and shall deter the *ill-minds* from prejudice our educational system which, *normally*, is not meant to produce *degree holders* but skilled and qualified bodies.

Higher Education

The pillar of social stability, sustainability and active engagement in the global knowledge economy is a well-educated proletariat. As a result, most countries have set goals to increase the share of the population with higher education and/or broaden access to higher education for individuals that are under-represented because of socio-economic status, race, ethnicity, religion, age, gender, [dis]ability or location. Formal education in Pakistan is being offered at various level from school to university level. Globalization in higher education resulted in an increase of universities. The number of universities in Pakistan increased dramatically by 2020. There are around 200 Universities (public & private) as compared to two in 1947. Furthermore public sector is traditionally considered as the major provider of higher education but this scenario changed consequently growth of higher education institutions complemented with the increase of the private sector, sets the stage for a wide range & type of education. The sub-committee discussed the potential areas for policy formulation as review of number of universities along with their categorization, enrolment with identification of universities having low participation rate; access to higher education with focus on gender equity and equality; quality of higher education; existence of indigenous research; outcome based higher education and its alignment with Bloom's Taxonomy of Education Objectives; introduction of online education; framework for reform/ revamp in higher education for dealing with matters of governance, management, university culture and environment, attitude of high authorities/ bodies, infrastructure, curriculum, learning material, linkages, research and innovation. **For this purpose, five key thematic areas were identified for policy recommendations which include governance, access, quality, equity & finance and innovation & relevance.** The sub-committee identifies key gaps and challenges as a) **discrepancies in model acts of both private and public sector universities;** b) **insufficient provision of funds to universities and DAIs;** c) **inappropriate grant mechanism;** d) **lack of ambitions to focus on the research, innovation, commercialization, and its relevance for achieving economic gains and employment in exploring the benefits gained from science to be at the forefront of national and global competition for new and advanced technologies and other innovations;** e) Complicated mechanism of quality assurance (internal) and (External) with more focus **on documentation and no follow-up timelines;** f) disintegration of goals of access and successful participation of learners; g) lack of application and relevancy of learning outcomes **due to content based learning behavior;** h) absence of online education and i) issues relating to the defined roles of HEC Pakistan and HEC Sindh in lieu of 18th Constitutional amendment. The sub-committee proposes key policy recommendation including a) **review of model acts for private and public sector universities in consultation with experts and stakeholders;** b) provision of sufficient funds to the universities and DAIs based on a revised grant mechanism in connection with strong quality assurance mechanism; c) **introduction of innovative system based on a well-developed enabling environment, featuring stable macro-economic, institutional, and regulatory frameworks prioritizing innovation directed towards societal challenges;** d) ensuring innovation and relevancy policy support through regulatory framework, economic and fiscal instrument, demand support, regional innovation strategy and networking, trade policy, capacity building and information provision, and information & cultural instruments; e) Realistic Reforms by Development of Framework on Quality; f) **Accreditation procedure must for open & virtual models;** g)

development of a feedback system from HEC on the documents submitted for quality assurance so that **the lapses, strengths and weaknesses can be identified by the HEIs and those lapses and weaknesses can be reconsidered and worked on in order to avoid those in their future practices**; h) Access to higher learning should be made possible to **all regardless of race, ethnicity, gender, economic or social class, age, language, religion, location or [dis]abilities**; i) International mobility, exchanges and cross-border education activities must integrate the twin goals of increased access and equitable participation; j) **indigenous research/individuals & problems as an important variable affecting the link of indigenous people with society, community & mainstream industry**; k) Outcome based Higher Education and alignment with Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives'; l) Online Education; m) Framework of Reform at Higher Education/ Revamping in Higher Education and n) Collaboration with HEC and its Policies after 18th Amendment.

9. **Technical and Vocational Education**

None can deny the importance of TVET for progress of a country. This has also been covered in the report in detail which says as:-

Technical Education & Vocational Training (TVET) has far-reaching benefits in development of workforce and making nations to compete in the global workplace and achieving social and economic gains. **Out of total Pakistani labour force, around 70%-80% is comprised of skilled youth which is either trained by formal TVET institutes or they gained skills from informal sector (Ustad-Shagrid System) with highest employment rate.** The remaining 20-30% of workforce is coming from general education with comparatively lesser employment rate. **Approximately 200,000 jobs annually are created / available for skilled youth in various private and public sector industries, enterprises and government organizations in Sindh.** Whereas, the entire TVET sector in Sindh is producing a maximum of **94,315** skilled workers annually through 287 public (including 252 STEVTA institutes) and 387 private institutes in over 150 trades / technologies.....In addition to Sindh TEVTA, there are two public sector testing & certification bodies in the province i.e. Sindh Board of Technical Education with a mandate to affiliate, conduct examination and certification of public and private training institutes in technical education stream; and Trade Testing Board Sindh with a mandate to perform same business for vocational stream. The report identifies gaps and challenges in sub-sector as; i) **difficulty in decision making due to colossal STEVTA Board of Governors (currently 19 members, 02 MPAs, 06 secretaries, 05 industrialists, 01 each from agriculturist, Mehran University of Engineering, NAVTTC, MD STEVTA)**; ii) the SBTE Board not having representation of **MD STEVTA, NAVTTC, BBSUTSD, Mehran & NED Engineering Universities, the most relevant organizations**; iii) **lack of coordination between two parallel bodies operating in Sindh i.e. the Board of Technical Education and Trade Testing Board**; iv) **no rationalization of programs offered in public sector TVET institutes located within close vicinity i.e. 5-10 km of radius, resulting low enrolment in each one**; v) **Non-compliance of terms and conditions of appointment of Managing Director under STEVTA Act**; vi) **No minimum standard / criteria for establishing a new or upgrading an existing institute**; vii) **no effective / mandatory registration & affiliation system for private institutes**; viii) **no systemic institute-industrial-linkage and On-Job-Training arrangement for quality training and greater employability of skilled youth**; ix) **Insufficient human resource at STEVTA due to 40%+ vacant teaching positions with no recruitments since 2012 creating huge vacuum and organizational imbalance.** x) **teachers working at irrelevant technology positions and administrative positions**; xi) **irrelevant and outdated programs resulted low participation of female**; xii) **non-availability of market driven programs such as Robotics, Artificial**

Intelligence, Big Data, Mechatronics, and Heavy Machine Operations etc.;
xiii) maximum capacity of existing TVET institutes (public and private) to provide 50% of the annual demand of skilled workers; xiv) less government investment and more donor funded programs; xv) no certification and recognition system for informally skilled youth in Sindh (Ustad-Shagrid-System); xvi) lack of infrastructure facilities, resources and equipment for TVET learning environment; xvii) low participation ratio of skilled youth of Sindh in overseas job markets as compared to other provinces (9.1% Sindh, 29.7% KP and 50% Punjab), due to no-structured link of TVET institutes with overseas employment promoters; xviii) less number of apprenticeship training in Sindh (1,500 apprentices trained as compared to 45,000 apprentices in Punjab); xix) No third stream of education as Matric-Tech as an option for students who are not interested in science or humanities education groups; and xx) old and traditional mechanism of budget and fund provision proving not effective for successful TVET activities. On basis of gaps and challenges, the report finds key recommendations as; **i) Review and amendment in existing rules and regulations for authorizing STEVTA for control on the transfer, posting, promotions and appointment of BS-17 and above staff (Civil and Public Servants to make it autonomous in performing its functions; ii) proposal of merging TTB with SBTE under the administrative control of STEVTA (as of Punjab model); iii) re-composition of SBTE Board; iv) Introduction of shared funding-governance model for apprenticeship through effective collaboration with private sector and industry (on pattern of federal government); v) all non-functional institutes to be operated under Public-Private-Partnership; vi) Ensuring of compliance of tenure and terms & conditions of appointment of MD-STEVTA; vii) immediate recruitment at vacant posts through 3rd party; viii) no teachers to be posted on administrative posts; ix) a robust and machine based M&E system for staff and institutes (public and private); x) regulate mandatory registration and quality assurance mechanism of private training institutes in Sindh; xi) ensuring minimum infrastructure facilities, resources and equipment in TVET institutes; xii) rationalization and consolidation of TVET institutes located within close vicinity (5-10 km); xiii) all TVET institutes to be linked with relevant industry in the vicinity through modern apprenticeship schemes for practical work / OJT; xiv) Introduction of Smart-Lab and Smart Classroom concept, in case no industry exists in close vicinity; xv) within three years all its existing training programs to be transferred into modern national CBT System on the pattern of Punjab and KP TEVTA; xvi) Introduction of Matric-Tech as third stream of education for greater employability of youth and image building of TVET sector on the patter of Federal and KP governments; xvii) enhancement of the quality of examination & certification by SBTE and TTB at the level of international repute; xviii) establishment of production-cum-training facilities & introduce local handi-craft trades like pottery, wood-work, Bengal making, Ajrak & Rilli making etc.; xix) introduction of mandatory licensing & registration of skilled workers in across Sindh for ensuring quality assurance mechanism; xx) Provision of budget and finances in accordance with STEVTA Act to make authority financially autonomous;**

10. We, normally, complain of unemployment but the report itself indicates that approximately **200,000 jobs** annually become available under such head but what such education institution (s) produce annually is **94,315** which, too, with not that standard as is demand of the globe. The proposal (s), I believe, if are worked on shall not only produce qualified skilled persons but shall surely provide them an opportunity of earning livelihood.

Teacher Education and Continuous Professional Development

Needful to add that since spreading of the education (*Ilm*) is not possible without a 'USTAD'/Teacher who, all over the *globe*, is recognized with **respect**. Our religion gives the '*Ustad*' the most respect by giving him the status of '*Ruhani/spiritual father*' therefore, there can't be and shouldn't be any compromise over qualities of a **teacher/Ustad**. This aspect, *even*, has properly been covered in the report. The report shows efforts of Sindh government but concludes as:-

.. Some other key gaps of teacher education and CPD were included; i) lack of vision of teacher education and CPD, ii) disconnect between pre-service and in-service teacher education, iii) disconnect between theory and practice, iv) weak link between schools and teacher education institutions, v) teaching profession is not considered as the first choice of many fresh graduates, vi) recruitment rules and policy is not specific to teacher education programs only; vii) teachers' lack of academic and professional competencies, viii) teachers' pedagogies focus on developing students' lower order of cognitive skills-rote learning, ix) teacher teach textbooks rather than curriculum, x) lack of teachers' access to curriculum, syllabus and scheme of studies, xi) inadequate provision of libraries and laboratories, xii) lack of financial sustainability, xiii) lack of integration of technology in teacher education and CPD, xiv) disconnect between CPD and career progression of teachers and others, xv) lack of coordination between various institutions, xvi) non-serious attitude of teachers and others about in-service or CPD activities, xvii) non-existence of teacher educators preparation programs and xviii) lack of incentives to teachers and others to attend CPD programs as part of their career ladder and progression. Some key policy directions emerged from the situation analysis which include; i) to ensure use of Revised Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives (Remember, Understand, Apply, Analyze, Evaluate and Create) in classroom teaching learning process; ii) to introduce teachers' performance appraisal system on basis of use Revised Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives (Remember, Understand, Apply, Analyze, Evaluate and Create) in classroom teaching learning process; iii) to align teacher education with rapidly changing education scenario and the contextual needs, ii) to attract best graduates to join teaching profession, iii) to provide access of technology to prospective teachers and teacher educators, iv) to link CPD with teachers' and others' career progression, v) to contribute towards teaching profession and career growth of the educational practitioners, and vi) update/restructure teacher education institutions. Teacher education and CPD programs need to be transformed in light of globalization, technological advancements, Learning Framework of the 21st Century, Sustainable Development Goals 2030 and rapidly changing education scenario in the country, in general and Sindh province, in particular. **The overall recommendations emerging from the review of teacher education and CPD programs include; i) update vision and mission of teacher education and CPD programs for raising standards and align with the international standards, ii) rationalize the deployment of specialist teacher educators, iii) upgrade the 'Elementary Colleges of Education' as Colleges of Education', iv) restructure the 'Provincial Institute of Teacher Education' as an 'Academy of Educational Leadership and Development', v) make CPD programs mandatory for all teachers, education managers and others for their promotion and career growth, vi) develop professional relationships between schools and teacher education institutions and universities, vii) create**

institutional collaboration and networking, and viii) prepare prospective teachers as ‘reflective practitioners’ and ‘pedagogical leaders’.

Private Education

For this, the Committee while detailing the private education as:-

..To ensure the quality of education in Private Schools and Colleges, a Private Institutions Management and Quality Assurance Board has been constituted. At DRIPIS a complaint Centre is established and the DRIPIS also received complain from students’, parents, civil society and teachers of private institutions. The committee identifies gaps and challenges for administrative and academic matters including a) ineffective implementation of The Sindh Private Education Institutions (Regulation & Control) Ordinance 2001, Amendment Act–2003 and Rules 2005 & amended Rules 2020; b) issues of rationalization and maintaining of the fee structure at institutions; c) appointment of Non-Professional teachers at low salary by the institutions and in some cases without issuing proper appointment orders / terms and conditions; d) without prior notice shutdown of Private institutions functioning in rented buildings; e) non submission of Annual report / general information to the registering authority including annual audit report, admission policy, detail of 10% free ship and P.T.A meetings as required by the law; f) issues in disbursement of scholarship or allowing free ship to students’ by the Private Institution; g) monitoring and Maintaining Quality Assurance as Vehicle for the Officer in Provincial & Regional Directorates not available; h) payment issues of remuneration to members of inspection committee; i) assistance to polio teams, measles teams, de-worming teams and typhoid during the campaign; and j) assistance to election commission in the election for verification and finalization of polling stations in the private institutions. The sub-committee proposes key policy recommendations categorization of private institutions according to the facilities available in the institutions; Development of Quality Assurance Setup & Manual; Amendments in Rules and Procedures for free ship/scholarship to be awarded by the private institutions to the deserving students’ and 10% Free-ship to be funded by the government to the private institutions at the rate of approved fee structure; DIRPIS for both private schools and colleges; and PPP model for 4000 non-functional government schools.

11. Amendments in Rules & Procedure for free ship / scholarship and 10% free-ship shall surely help poor student (s) to study in private sector which, otherwise, was / is the obligation of the private education sector, therefore, work on such aspect needs acceleration.

Non-Formal/ Adult Education

We, normally, do not hear about Non-formal / Adult education but the report shows that :

... To expand the access landscape of education delivery to deprived sections of the society, there seems a dire need of Non Formal Education System which can supplement to the mainstream education sector. For this purpose, Sindh has necessary legislative (*Sindh Non Formal Education Policy 2017*) and institutional structure and framework (*Directorate of Literacy and Non Formal Education*) for imparting education delivery to the out of school children in the province through non formal approach and alternate learning paths. Sindh has comparatively large number of learning centers, 3896, for providing access to education to 157,469 learners for NFE primary level. Sindh has also planned to enhance the number of NFE and ALP learning

centers to 20,588 for expanding yearly capacity for the access to education to 617,661 children and youth of the province till 2024. The Directorate of Literacy & NFE has categorized curricula and related textbooks into four education and literacy programs: a) NFBE/ ALP (Primary); b) NFBE/ ALP (Elementary); c) Adult Literacy; and d) Integrated Literacy & skill programs for Agriculture, Livestock and Masonry. It is apprised that the said curricula have/are being developed using Blooms' Taxonomy as a guiding principle. The three year-long accelerated curriculum (Primary) i.e. (1) Package A (kacchi & one class); (2) Package B (two & three class); and (3) Package C (four & five class) is a condensed form of five-year long primary education to accommodate the learning needs of multi-age children. Majority of these children have either been out of school or have dropped out at various stages. The curriculum allows the learners to follow the pace of their cognitive development and complete their primary school education in three years. The report finds key challenges and gaps for not acquiring desired results under non-formal education regime. They include; i) limited functional ability of the NFE institutional governance structure which lacks technical and professional competency, ii) challenges of institutional capacity in data management, reporting and data analysis, maintenance and operations of the database system; iii) most of NFE programs and interventions are project driven funded by donors/ development partners with short term targets and unsustainable interventions, iv) staff capacity development programs, plans and resources are not considered a regular and systematic activity to be accounted for a regular/ current budgetary allocations, v) government budget and finance allocation and support are too sufficient to implement NFE programs and interventions (the budgetary support for regular NFE establishment has historically been around 2-3% of total education budget), vi) community unawareness about demand driven learning programs along with life skills education through NFE schemes, vii) lack to develop strong coordination with relevant stakeholders including community and NFE target population, viii) lack of involvement of the relevant directorates and allied institutions in NFE activities, ix) marginal private sector participation and collaboration in NFE programs and interventions, and x) no innovative approaches including use of social media and ICT in NFE activities. The government, being aware of the gaps and weaknesses in the existing system, is devising strategies for promoting basic education on priority. For this purpose, the report outlines some policy recommendations to be used for short-term, medium-term and long-term planning; i) review of NFE institutional governance structure in accordance with institutional role as envisaged in NFE policy 2017, ii) enhancing institutional ability not only for administrative nature work, but also capacity of technical and professional competency for the functions and activities relating to academic and learning attributes, iii) enhancing institutional capacity in data management, reporting and data analysis, maintenance and operations of the database system under NF-EMIS, iv) introduction of robust and fully functioning monitoring, evaluation and research system for monitoring progress of staff, programs, partners, registered NFE providers, projects etc., v) innovative and need based education and literacy programs for out-of-school children and illiterate youth and adults, vi) integration of technical and vocational skills in all NFE programs to benefit youth and prepare them for continuing education and skills attainment, vii) Priority to the geographical areas having most number of OOSC for establishment of NFE learning centers, viii) Implementation of Bloom Taxonomy stages in all NFE and ALP learning activities including curriculum development, textbook material development, classroom delivery, assessment, CPD of teachers/facilitators, monitoring of service delivery etc., ix) the robust and holistic training/ CPD for NFE teachers, x) Introduction of Non-Formal Education Assessment System (NFEAS) for assessment and certification of NFE/ ALP through 3rd party assessment system, xi) ensuring adequate financial resources with gradually enhancement to, at least 10% of the total education budget till 2030, xii) budget allocation for NFE and ALP, within next three years, on recurrent side, xiii) priority to wealth quantile (poorest to richest), location (rural to urban-having most number of OOSC) and sex (girls to boys) in four strands of NFE policy, xiv) accreditation, certification and equivalence system for

all NFE and ALP programs for admission in formal education, professional, technical and vocational trades and for job provisions in general, skill-based and life learning fields, business and industry, xv) enhancement of private sector participation and collaboration in NFE programs and interventions will be enhanced, xvi) Public Private Partnership (PPP) for NFE programs and projects, and xvii) innovative approaches including use of social media and ICT with broad objectives of awareness, orientation and service delivery will be used to expand reach out to the potential NFE learners.

Public-Private Partnership (PPP)

The PPP has been playing its vital role in education system. This, *too*, has been discussed and says:-

... The PPP concept got its originality into a semi-autonomous agency in the shape of Sindh Education Foundation (SEF), Even at present date, the Foundation is functioning in full throttle and providing education to almost half a million children (450,000 students) through different Public-Private Partnership initiatives in SEF assisted 1845 schools. Sindh Education Foundation (SEF) has been a pioneer in effectively engaging the private sector and communities in government school revival through the Adopt-A-School-Program (AASP). The program facilitates private sector and civil society to adopt public or government run schools and undertake educational improvements for children. The program has made significant progress in quantitative and quantitative terms; starting out in 1998, AASP is now supporting 582 Govt. schools with the help of 102 school adopters in 18 districts of the province benefiting over 131,000 children and approximately 4981 teachers reflecting the growing interest and inclination of the civil society and the private sector in the revival of public sector education. The more advance concept of PPP in education sector outlines in the Education Management Organization (EMO) reform as introduced in 2014 after Sindh Public Private Partnership (PPP) Act was passed in 2010. The EMO initiative aims to establish government partnerships with credible Education Management Organizations from private sector to manage and improve the functioning of public schools. The private partner gets the reimbursable amount of expenditures incurred as agreed financial proposal and verified by a third party i.e. Independent Auditor for carrying out learning activities in the contracted school(s) while receives its management fee on basis of its score achieved in Key Performance Indicators (KPIs) as evaluated by a third party i.e. Independent Expert in each quarterly performance report. Under EMO model, five (5) rounds of procurement, so far, have been completed for 139 schools in 6 districts i.e. Sukkur, Khairpur, Larkana, Kamber Shahdaktot, Dadu and Karachi. Seven (7) credible Education Management Organizations (EMOs) have been selected, after a competitive process of outsourcing management and operations of these 139 schools, of which 68 schools are reconstructed under Sindh Basic Education Program (SBEP) scheme and 71 schools are nearby to these SBEP schools. The number of beneficiary reaches 70,000 children. A PPP has also been made for one Teacher Training Institute in Karachi, on the above mentioned model and procedure. The institute, in its full strength, will produce 120 prospective teachers' graduates along with providing CPD to 60 in-service teachers every year. Other gaps have been identified as i) PPP initiative for schools only whereas no PPP for other departments and government bodies / attached departments of the education sector including college education, higher education, technical education, non-formal education, early childhood education and special education; ii) strengthening of the PPP node of School Education and Literacy Department has been a challenge for many years; iii) lack of coordination and/or confidence between EMOs and local administration minimizing effectiveness of the EMO reform; iv) no culture and plans of research on impact analysis of PPP intervention; v) less attraction for private sector to make more healthy competition and speedy engagement; vi) lack of certain government machinery support and facilitation for PPP programs and projects (both SEF assisted and EMO managed) adds challenges to the effectiveness and

success of the partners' efforts; and vii) despite evidence of potential to scale up the per child subsidy based model, it couldn't be scale up quickly with an emerging market demand in Sindh (Punjab Education Foundation (PEF), established in same year of SEF, expands its beneficiary scale to 3 million children); **In light of the situation analysis and gaps & challenges, key recommendations pertinent to cross-cutting areas including access, quality, governance, financing, international commitments, legislation, policies, research, equity and systems are given as follows; i) development of a holistic PPP policy for education sector on the parameters to define the legal regime, administrative and approval processes involved, powers held by the government agency, type of government support and other related matters; ii) in order to be more responsive to the needs to the province, more partnerships to be made with the private sector by outsourcing them the management of the school with accountable for improvement for the Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs) while retaining the financial responsibility with the government; iii) consultation for large schools under per child subsidy model; iv) expansion of philanthropic participation under Adopt a School Program initiative; v) the PPP management solution for 'Teachers Training Institutes' (TTI) across the province to make optimal use of the public resources; vi) testing systems (including teachers and students assessments) to be outsourced through PPPs; options to use PPPs for other sub-sectors of education including higher education, college education, non-formal education, technical and vocational education, early childhood education and special education; vii) a digitized "One Window" at department level linked with other departments / allied institutions to assist partners in all matters for timely issue management; and strengthen government role as regulator and improve its 'Governance' function while focus more on Public-Private Partnerships frameworks for implementation.**

Libraries

Library has been placed at *last* which however is undeniably is important part of the educational system because without books there can be no concept of *education* which is, rightly, shown as gateways to knowledge and culture. Right words have been chosen to describe the role and importance of library as:-

... The resources and services they offer create opportunities for learning, support literacy and education, and help shape the new ideas and perspectives that are central to a creative and innovative society. The sub-committee on Libraries collected data/ statistics of libraries in School, Colleges, Universities and Public with reference to Infrastructure, Budget and Human Resources. Four categories of libraries were identified as culture and public libraries; local bodies (Govt.); academic libraries and children libraries. The current administrative cum legislative structure in Libraries across Sindh was discussed and reviewed. It was discussed to instigate the love of books and reading activities in the kids and the ideas for learning activities, kids' games, kids' small theatres and other academic activities for the kinds to be done in libraries. The sub-committee proposes key recommendations as a) **enactment of library legislation to provide a legal foundation to the library system in Sindh Province for the development and growth of Public Libraries and also establishment of a Sindh Library Board OR Authority to provide advisory, administrative guideline and approve appointments on reporting library departments;** b) GoS annual financial contribution per capita in the range of PKR 50 per capita for establishment and growth of public library system in the Province; c) **introduction of a three tier Library System to be established in next two years;** d) proposing model library spaces along with capacity at each tier.

12. The referral to above was / is meant to show that it was / is the serious work by the Committee and its sub-committee (s) which, *prima facie*, have helped us in identifying the lacking in our *Educational System* which, too, with suggestions towards bringing it in line with *globe* so that we could hope that our public education system, *hopefully*, shall not remain in third tier and our children (as most of them are dependent upon public sector) will enjoy good quality education under *best* least *better* teacher (s).

13. At this juncture it would be relevant to reproduce relevant portion of proposals for betterment of education and to bring the education of public sector in Sindh to higher level to compete with other Provinces thereby enabling the parents to dream of best education for their children which, *normally*, is claimed by private sector only.

14. This court highly appreciates Dr. Iqbal Hussain Durrani, Chairman of Education Committee and other Members particularly Dr. Muhammad Memon, Chairman, B.I.S.E. Hyderabad and Mr. Asad Abro, Head of Reform Support Unit (Education Department), who with all their expertise and by precious time worked with dedication in order to serve this Province, without any remuneration. This is the work which was / is to operate as a **back-bone** of the nation, therefore, such *sincere* effort (s), I admit, can't be appreciated in words but if (work) is owned by quarter concerned, *hopefully*, shall bring the desired results. The Committee, per report, is of the view that there shall be established a **Sindh Education Policy Oversight Council** to monitor the Public Sector Education to overcome the shortcomings as pointed out by the Education Committee. Such recommendations are that :-

"OVERALL IMPLEMENTATION STRATEGY

Proposal for the Establishment of Sindh Education Policy Oversight Council :

Introduction

A policy development cycle of the education sector entails various stages; Analysis, Planning, Implementation and Evaluation. After completion of the first stage, the committee constituted by the Honorable High Court of Sindh has proposed key policy recommendations for the improvement of education sector in Sindh. Based on these recommendations, each stakeholder will work on stage 2 and 3 (i.e. planning and implementation), but the past experiences show that Sindh has encountered challenges related to the fourth stage of policy cycle (i.e. monitoring & evaluation) and it has become the most common factor for not achieving the desired outcomes of the policy initiatives.

Keeping in view the gap analysis of policy interventions and implementation framework, it is strongly recommended that an oversight structure may be established with a mandate to collect and analyze the progress on the proposed policy recommendations for improving access, quality and governance in Sindh education sector. For this purpose, a high-powered “*Sindh Education Policy Oversight Council*” has been proposed having a precise and specific mandate of regular monitoring and support for effective implementation of the proposed key policy recommendations. However, the respective departments will be solely responsible for planning and implementation of the policy recommendations as per their mandate.

The Secretariat of the Sindh Education Policy Oversight Council will be located in the Reform Support Unit of School Education & Literacy Department, Government of Sindh for an oversight of the implementation of key recommendations in the education sector.

Composition of Sindh Education Policy Oversight Council:

The proposed structure of the high-powered ‘Sindh Education Policy Oversight Council’ is as follows:

• The Chief Secretary Sindh	Chairperson
• Secretary, School Education and Literacy Department, Government of Sindh	Member/ Secretary
• Secretary, Universities and Boards (U&B) Department, Government of Sindh	Member
• Secretary, Sindh Higher Education Commission (SHEC)	Member
• Secretary, College Education Department, Government of Sindh	Member
• Secretary, Culture Department, Government of Sindh	Member
• Secretary, Local Government Department, Government of Sindh	Member
• Managing Director, Sindh Education Foundation	Member
• Managing Director, STEVTA	Member
• Two educationists (General and Technical Education)	Members

The Secretary School Education and Literacy Department, Government of Sindh will be notified as a 'Focal Person' for communication, coordination, and correspondence with a mandate given by the Council. The proposed Secretariat will be at Reform Support Unit, School Education and Literacy Department and will have separate designated staff from School Education and Literacy Department for administrative and technical support to establish database administration, progress analysis, expert advice and counter emerging challenges.

Terms of Reference (ToRs)

The key responsibilities of the council are given below;

- To structure monitoring and analytical framework for tracking the progress of the implementation of policy recommendations/ initiatives.
- To hold quarterly meetings of the council.
- To regularly monitor and review the activities under policy recommendations and submit the quarterly reports based on the progress report submitted by the respective departments.
- To propose corrective measures for effective implementation of the policy recommendations (wherever necessary).
- To develop a dashboard for monitoring progress with access to all the concerned quarters.
- To communicate and coordinate through the Secretary School Education and Literacy Department, Government of Sindh on behalf of the Sindh Education Policy Oversight Council regarding the proposed actions.

CONCLUSION

An extensive review of the various policy reform initiatives and **a long consultative process with the key stakeholders** suggest several factors responsible for the colossal challenges and chronic problems **which have badly affected education access, quality, and good governance**. During the consultative dialogues, absence of effective monitoring mechanism for the implementation of the policy recommendations has been identified a key determinant of failure of the policy action. Keeping in view the past experiences, a principle of consolidation, strengthening institutional capacity, effective coordination, good governance and smart implementation and effective monitoring framework was adopted to formulate an education policy reform in Sindh. **This policy report covers eleven (11) education sub-sectors and various cross-cutting themes within a broader framework of Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives and normative and legal framework of education system in Sindh (Annexure-1).**

The final report comprising key policy recommendations of eleven (11) sub-sectors and themes of the education sector, is hereby submitted before the Honorable Court for appropriate orders. **The policy recommendations have been supplemented with the**

implementation strategies augmented by a proposed structure of 'Sindh Education Policy Oversight Council' as a high-powered oversight body to monitor the implementation of key education policy reform initiatives which has been endorsed by the Education Committee. This framework will ensure coherence across the sub-sector goals and a clear route for effective implementation of the education reform initiatives.

The policy recommendations as envisaged in this report may not be considered as an alternate to existing education policies and plans but **a supplementary tool and resource for bringing about improvement in education system.** We hope this report would be helpful to the planners, policy makers and would yield the desired results to ensure inclusive and equitable quality education for all and promote critical thinking, creativity, and lifelong learning culture in the education institutions. We are very grateful to the Honorable Court for the **guidance and support provided during the critical deliberations and proceedings for formulation of education policy reforms.**

Dated 15-03-2021

DR. IQBAL HUSSAIN DURRANI
Chairman Education Committee
Karachi."

15. The '**issue involved**' is of such importance and *vitality* that it can *safely* be said as nothing short of our '**future**' which, *undeniably*, rests on '**knowledge and skills**' of **generation (s)** and because of this sole reason all, including Islam, insists on '**Ilam** (education)' for all. Every single effort in this regard is always worth appreciating and a *positive* step must not be delayed merely for *monetary* question *even*. Most of the composition of the **Council** is based on government Official (s) who are *always* believed to provide their *best* for betterment of their **next generation** hence it is believed that they, if entrusted with such *vital* assignment, shall *surely* provide their best within their *best* skills and expertise.

16. Accordingly, Chief Secretary Sindh shall ensure that that Sindh Education Policy Oversight Council is notified by the Government of Sindh within a period of fifteen days after completing all requisite formalities. In the end, I would add that worth appreciating guidelines (recommendations) that have come on surface

through the *final report*, covering all stage (s) of our educational system, as well assistance provided by Mr. Ahmed Bux Narejo, Secretary School Education during the course of hearing, but since I am *quite* conscious that such labour should receive its *due* therefore, it would be in all fairness to have view (s) of all key-Secretaries of Government of Sindh i.e ***Finance; Universities & Boards; Colleges & Schools; M.D., STEVTA:*** on final report so as to provide any further *ease* in achieving the objectives.

Office: Copies of Final report be provided to all said Secretaries who shall ensure their appearance on next date with their view so as to make the path a little *easy*. Since, the work was / is for the public sector education system therefore the copies thereof be also sent to Directorate(s) of Primary, Secondary Education of all Divisions, Higher Secondary Schools, Directorates of all Colleges, Vice Chancellors of all public Universities; for their information till the Council is notified and starts working.

J U D G E

IK

ORDER SHEET
IN THE HIGH COURT OF SINDH AT KARACHI

SUIT NO.1243/2015

Date

Order with signature of Judge

06.05.2021

.....

Since order has been announced, to come up on 26.05.2021 at 11:30 a.m. for compliance in view of paragraph No.16 of the order. Accordingly as directed, all relevant Secretaries as well M.D. STEVTA shall appear in person.

Issue notice on application u/s 151 CPC. Office shall assign number to it.

J U D G E

IK