ORDER SHEET IN THE HIGH COURT OF SINDH AT KARACHI

SUIT NO.1418/2021

Date	Order with signature of Judge

For hearing of CMA No.10443/2021

16.11.2021

Mr. Mujtaba Raja advocate for plaintiffs.

Mr. Sheharyar Qazi, Additional A.G. Sindh alongwith Mr. Abdul Raheem Soomro, Secretary, Mr. Zahid Abbas Akhund, Director and Mr. Abdul Fateh Shaikh, Director, (A&M), Culture, Tourism, Antiquities and Archives Department.

Mr. Ghulam Akbar Lashari advocate for defendant No.3 - SBCA.

•••••

<u>O R D E R</u>

SALAHUDDIN PANHWAR, J. Heard learned counsel for respective

parties as well the Secretary, Culture, Tourism, Antiquities and

Archives Department.

2.

On last date of hearing viz. 02.11.2021 following order

was passed :-

"Focal person of Culture, Tourism, Antiquities and Archives Department, contends that they are taking measures in view of judgment passed by this court with regard to examination of heritage properties notified under the Heritage Act 1994 and will submit complete lists alongwith written statement on next date.

Needless to mention that **Culture, Tourism, Antiquities and Archives Department, shall classify properties in two groups, one notified under the Heritage Act 1994 and another notified under the Ancient Monument Preservation Act 1904.** Needless to mention that in judgment passed by divisional bench of this court properties notified under the Act of 1994 whereas Culture, Tourism, Antiquities and Archives Department, is not entitled to examine the architectural value of the properties/places as notified under the Act of 1904 therefore both lists shall be filed separately." 3. Pursuant to that, Secretary, Culture, Tourism, Antiquities and Archives Department, present submits list of protected sites/monuments under the Antiquities Act 1975 as under:-

	1975	IONUMENTS UNDER ANTIQ	011
łyde	erabad District		
1.	Tomb of MianGhulam Shah Kalhora	Kalhora Colony, Hirabad, Hyderabad	1
2.	Boundary Wall of Pucca Fort, Hyderabad	Near Shahi Bazar, Hyderabad	1
3.	Old Offices and Tajar (Treasury) of Mirs	Inside Pucca Fort, Hyderabad	1
4.	Tomb of MianGhulamNabiKalhoro	Hirabad, Jall Road, Hyderabad	1
5.	Haram of TalpurMirs	Inside Pucca Fort, Hyderabad	_
6.	One Enclosures containing Tomb of TalpurMirs	These Tombs are situated in Hirabad, District Hyderabad	11(A)
7.	Tower now used as New Water Tank	Inside Pucca Fort, Hyderabad	111
8.	Two Mosques and a Tomb	Near TandoFazalTown, District Hyderabad	1
9.	Tomb of Sarfaraz Khan Kalhoro	Sarfaraz Colony, Hyderabad	I
10.	Masque of Mirs	Ward E, Inside Pucca Fort, Hyderabad	1
11.	Tajar (Treasury) of Mirs	At Pucca Fort, Hyderabad	1
San	ghar District		
12.	Qubba Mir Shahdad	Near ShahpurChakar Tehsil, Shahdadpur, District Sanghar	1
13.	AncientCity Remains Brahmanabad (Mansura)	DehJamrao, TalukaSinjhoro, District Sanghar	11
14.	Mound Thulh	DehKotBijar, TalukaSinjhoro, District Sanghar	111
15.	Graveyard	Tehsil Shahdadpur, District Sanghar	111
Bad	in District		
16.	Ruins of Old City at Badin	Village Ali Shah Goth, District Badin	111
Tan	do Muhammad Khan District		
17.	Buddhist Stupa	Near Taṇdo Muhammad Khan, District Tando Muhammad	I
Mat	iari District		
18.	Hala Monuments (Mirs Tombs)	Situated northern side from Hala Town, Matiari	1
19.	Mai Khairi – ji – Masjid	Misri Shah Mohallah, Nasarpur Town	II
20.	Nasar – ji – Mosque	Misri Shah Mohallah, Nasarpur Town	11
21.	Kirarh – Ji – Masjid	Misri Shah Mohallah, Nasarpur Town	11
Tan	doAllayar District		
22.	Wahyoon Tomb	Situated on the way from TandoAllayar to Tando Adam, District TandoAllayar	

1

- { 3 } -

Sh	aheedBenazirabad District (Nawabs	shah)	
23	and the second statement of the se	Village Thul Mir Rakun, District Nawabshah.	Ш
24	and the second designed and the second se	Deh Village Noor Muhammad, 17 miles from Daulatpur, District Nawabshah	1
25.	BhiroBham Mound	Deh. 67 Nasrat, Taluka and District Nawabshah	1
Tha	atta District		
26.	Brick Dome to the North East of the Tomb of Mubarak Khan (Tomb of Sister Fateh Khan)		1
27.	Tomb of Mubarak Khan S/O Jam Nizamuddin	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	1
28.			n
29.	Tomb and enclosure to the South East of above	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	Ш
30.	and the second	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	ш
31.	Brick Dome to the South of the Tomb above	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	n
32.	Sultan Ibrahim and other, Tomb wrongly known a amir Khalil's Tomb	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	1
33.	Tomb and compound wall of the yellow Stone to the South of Mirza Muhammad BaqiTarkhan Tomb Wrongly called Mirza Isa Khan's Tomb.	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	1
34.	Brick enclosure of MirzaBaqiBaigUzbak's Tomb it lies south of Nawab Isa Khan the Younger Tomb		
35,	Dabgir, Mosque	Thatta Town Sijawal Road, Thatta	1
36.	Graveyard Makli Hill	Thatta Northern at Makli Hill, District Thatta.	11
37.	Graveyard known as Goth Raji Malik MugamQadim Shah.	Village Abdullah Khan Deh Raj Malik Gharo and Sakro Road, District Thatta	I
18.	Sonda Graveyard.	Between Hyderabad-Thatta on National Highway at Sonda Village	1
9.	Jam Nizamuddin's Tomb	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	1
0.	Baradari	ThattaMakh Hill, District Thatta	1
1.	Tomb of Amir Sultan Muhammad S/o. Amir Hajika	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	T
2.	and the second state of participation of the second state of the s	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	1

-	{	4	}	-
---	---	---	---	---

3.	MirzaTughralBaig's Tomb	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	1
	MirzaJani and Mirza Ghazi Baig	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	1
15.	Stone Masonry Enclosure Containing the Tomb of Mirza Jan Baba and 12 other of Tarkhan Family wrongly known as Tomb of Zanan of Nawab Isa Khan.	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	I
16,	Mirza Muhammad BaqiTarkhan's Tomb wrongly called Mirza Isa Khan's Tomb.	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	1
47.	Stone Masjid with a Dome one Stone Pillars by side MirzaJaniBalg's Tomb.	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	1
48.	Brick Masjid and Enclosures near NawabShurfa Khan's Tomb supported to be the Tomb of Sayyed Amir Khan.	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	11
49.	Stone Masjid with Enclosure to the South of Mirza Muhammad BaqiTarkhan Tomb, Tomb of HabshadBalg.	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	11
50.	Tomb of Mirza Muhammad Isa (I) Turkhan.	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	1
51.	Brick Tomb Near the Tomb of AuliaPir.	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	11
52.	Tomb with Super Structure on Stone Pillars to the North of the tomb of Jam Nizamuddin.	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	Ш
53.	Brick Structure to the North of Tomb of Jam Nizamuddin.	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	Ш
54.	Tow Pavilions on Stone Pillars Over the Tombs to the South West of Tomb of Jam Muhammad.	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	П
55,	KalanKot	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	II
56.	Nawab Amir Khan's Mosque	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	11
57.	Building with two Domes near the CivilHospital, Thatta	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	11
58.	Jama Masjid	Thatta City, District Thatta	1
59,	SasyunjoTakar, MirpurSakro (Banbhore)	DehMirpurSakro, District Thatta	I
60.			
61.	Jam bijar Fort, MirpurSakro	DehPalejam near Ran Pathani Railway Station, District Thatta	П
62,	Tomb of NawabShurfa Khan	Makli Hill Monuments, Thatta	1
63.	Jamia Masjid	ThattaMakli Hill, District Thatta	
Kar	achi District		
64,	Chaukandi Tombs	18 miles away from Karachi north of Karachi Thatta Road	1
65.	Lakho Shaikh (Baloch Graveyard)	Baloch Graveyard on South East of Malir Cant., Karachi	1

•

Ghe	otki District	DehMathelo, Near MatheloTown, Taluka and	11
		Daudiiviena kuuna kuudu, biskiet tarkana	
90.	Three groups of Mounds known as DhamraojoDaro	from Badah Railway Station on BadahMeharKucha Road, District Larkana	
89.	1104101000 1 10 0110	Taluka and district Larkana Lies north west to the village Dhamrao, Six miles	11
88.	De Barerer.	Larkana	11
87.	Tomo or chan e	Near Fruit Market at Larkana City	
86.	TajjarBuilding	Larkana	
85.	Remains of Moenjodaro/ Buddhist Stupa on the Pre-historic remains near Moenjodaro		
	kana District		
84.		Village Khudabad, District Dadu	1
83.	Tomb of Yar Muhammad Khan Kalhora and Mosque		
82.		DehKhudabad, District Dadu	
81.		Village WahiPandhi, TalukaJohi, District Dadu	111
80.	Control of the second sec	DehPalah, District Dadu	III
)ad		DehShouk, TalukaJohi, District Dadu DehBehlil Shah, TalukaJohi, District Dadu	III III
		Division, Kotri, District Jamshoro	
78.	Mound Amri	Village Amri, Right side of Indus Highway Sub-	
77.	FortRaniKot	MahalKohistan, Deh Rani Kot, District Jamshoro	11
76.	Sehwan Fort	TalukaSehwan, District Jamshoro	111
0.00	Culou le cuerti	Jamshoro District Ismshoro	111
75.	Otham-jo-Bhutti	DehKerchat, TalukaMahalKohistan, District	Ш
74.	and a complete statement of the second statement of the se	DehKirchat Tehsil Kohistan, District Jamshoro	111
73.	Masum-ji-Bhuti (Mound)	DehKerchatMahal, District Jamshoro	111
72.	DambBhutti (Mound)	DehNarpivar, TalukaSehwan, District Jamshoro	111
	Lakhmir-ji-Mari	Deh Nang, Opposite Police Post Sehwan, District Jamshoro	111
	shoro District		
70.	Frere Hall	Karachi	-
59.	Mohatta Palace	Clifton, Karachi	-
58.	Khaliq Dina Hall & Library	M.A. Jinnah Road, Karachi	-
\$7.	Quaid-e-Azam Birth Place Museum	Kharadar Karachi	
56.	Quaid-e-Azam House Museum	Fatima Jinnah Road, Karachi	_

•

AU ME

- { 6 } -

-		District Ghotki	
	District		
	kur District	TalukaRohri	**
92. 93.	Shrine known as Styan-Jo-Than	Site Area Sukkur, 20 K.M. from SukkurCity	11
93.	Lakhian-jo-Daro Site Stone Tool Factory (Prehistoric)	Rohri Hill range from Rohri to Sukkur	**
95.	Mir Masum'sMinar	Minara Road, Sukkur at Sukkur City	1
96.	Mir Masum Shah tomb and Minar	Sukkur City	**
97.	Cantilever Bridge	On Indus river Between Sukkur and Rohri	1
98.	OM KanhiyaLal Cottage	Bundar Road, Rohri	11
99.	Entire Area of Bakkar Fort Including the Wall and Tomb of HazratKhatibSadaruddin Muhammad	Between Rohri and Sukkur	II
100.	Stone Tool Factory (East of Cement)	Rohri, District Sukkur	**
/ha	irpur District		
CONTRACTOR OF		DehNaroDhoro, Two miles east of	III
101	NaroWaroDhoro Mound	TandoMasti, District Khairpur	(a)
102	Diji-ji-Takari	Near KotDiji Fort, District Khairpur	1
	Fort at KotDiji	DehGhaunro, TalukaKotDiji, District Khairpur	
line	urkhas District		
	Main Buddhist Stupa (Kahoo-Jo-Daro)	Taluka& District Mirpurkhas	III
	Tomb of Arzi Khan Khokar	Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	II
	Tomb of Mir Khan Talpur	Chitori Goth Deh, No.24, District Mirpurkhas	II
	Tomb of Mir Jado	Deh 24 miles, Chitori, District Mirpurkhas	II
	Tomb known as Mir Murad Khan	Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	II
_	Tomb of Musa Khan	Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	II
1000	Tomb of Mir Rajo	Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	II
111	Brick Tomb known as ShaheedKapriBaloch	Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	11
112	Tomb Northern West of No.80 above (Name not known)	Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	11
	Tomb North West of No.81 above (Name not known)	Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	11
113.	Stone Tomb West of No.82, above	Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	II
	(Name not known)	at the death Dah No 24 District Mirpurkhas	11
114.	(Name not known) Tomb of Mir Fateh Khan Mir Mirza Khan	Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	
114.		Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	u

•

	AuliaPirChitoriBadshahOureshi		
118	8 Old Structures of a tomb and a Mosque	Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	11
119	Old Ruined Mosque	Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	11
120	Brick Tombs unknown	Chitori Goth Deh No.24, District Mirpurkhas	11
	erkot District		
	Mound at ShadiPhali	DehKhudaBux, District Umerkot	111
122.	Birth Place of Akbar the Great	2 K.M. away on north of UmerkotTown, District Umerkot	11
123.	Umerkot Fort	Taluka and District Umerkot	1
	parkar @ Mithi District Mound at Bhiro, Sherwah/NautojoDaro	Village Bhiro, District Tharparkar	111
	A stone Mosque with white Marble Pillars Bhodesar	Mosque with white Marble Situated at the bottom of KaroonJhar Hill TalukaNagarparkar District Tharparkar	
126.	Temple No.I,II, III & IVBhodesar	Situated at the bottom of KaroonJhar Hill TalukaNagarparkar District Tharparkar	
27.	Naukot Fort 1½ miles from the NaukotTown, District Tharparkar		
-	GoriTemple	Village Gori, Post DanoDandhal, TalukaNagarparkar, District Tharparkar	11
28.		Talukawagai parkar, District Thai parkar	

4. Can one take an exception to the historical value (s) of all such 'protected sites / monuments', declared / notified under the Ancient Monument Preservation Act 1904 and subsequently notified under the Antiquities Act 1975? The answer to this can be nothing but a big 'NO'. The Culture, Tourism, Antiquities and Archives Department was / is established with the sole purpose to ensure protection / preservation of these properties with their "antiquity'. It shall never be sufficient to give such properties in the relevant list or notification but requires much more including, but not limited to:-

- a) continuous control and management of such properties;
- b) managing these properties in such manner and fashion that none trespass into such properties;
- c) assuring that none cause any harm or damage to 'antiquity' thereof in any manner including removing / damaging anything from such properties;

These are all to be done by the department so that value of such declared / notified properties are assured to be as they **must be**.

"(i) any ancient product of human activity, movable or immovable, illustrative of art, architecture, craft, custom literature morals, politics, religion, warfare or science or <u>of any aspect of civilization or culture</u>"

Let the generation or world know the **civilization** or **culture** of past generation is responsibility of all those wherever such properties are found which one can't unless the same are protected / preserved, as insisted under the Act.

5. Accordingly, the department shall also submit the detail report as to how and what steps are being taken so as to ensure preserving **'antiquity value'** thereof. The report shall also include earlier and present picture (s) of these properties so as to see how these properties are being protected / preserved. Besides report shall also include pictures from google.

6. During hearing of listed applications, learned counsel for plaintiff contends that they have been condemned unheard while declaring their property viz. **Saddar Mansion** as **heritage** though direction were issued by the divisional bench of this court whereby departmental committee was required to provide opportunity of hearing. A full and proper hearing of those, having interests in such like (private) properties, was / is necessary and same cannot be taken while taking any decision effecting the status of such properties. When confronted, the Secretary present alongwith A.A.G. contends that this issue can be resolved and they will allow proper opportunity of hearing to the plaintiff. 7. At this juncture Secretary further contends that they are going to recruit **Tour guides** having requisite qualifications enabling the local as well as foreign tourists to provide them basic knowledge and cultural history and historical knowledge in scientific manner by the use of modern gadgets. Accordingly department shall ensure said appointments, preferably within six months.

8. Before talking about detailing basic knowledge and cultural history and historical knowledge, it is necessary to ensure protection / preservation of **antiquity value** thereof which the department shall have to acknowledge and admit. The damage / harm to such properties, I am to insist, can result in destroying the **'antiquity'** of such properties thereby leaving nothing but a **'building'** or a place, having no value at all. Here, it is also worth adding that the Act *itself* puts the department under heavy duty thereby:-

Section-19. Prohibition of destruction, damage etc of protected antiquities.—(1) No person shall except for carring out the purposes of this Act, destroy, break, damage, alter, injure, deface or mutilate or scribble, write or engrave any inscription or sign on any antiquity or take manure from any protected antiquity."

However, it is regret to admit that what normally is witnessed is *otherwise*. Thus, department is required to own its responsibility on war-basis thereby assuring that there does not come any further loss/ damage or defacing to such protected properties.

9. This is what the Department has to ensure which I hope shall be ensured in future. Further he contends that there is no concept of endowment fund to preserve the properties under the Antiquities Act and those are public properties having ancient history. 10. Under these circumstances, Secretary is also agreed that they will place summary with regard to **creation of endowment fund** keeping a room for public at large to join being stake holders while become member of the fund, to reserve/preserve ancient properties as mentioned in above referred properties as notified under the Antiquities Act 1975.

11. Needless to mention that properties under Ancient Monument Preservation Act 1904 Antiquities Act 1975 are not owned by any private person. The matter of ancient properties can not be equated as private properties under the Heritage Act 1994 but that of antiquities therefore judicial propriety demands serious attention on above reflected properties hence District and Sessions Judges all over Sindh shall depute Magistrate of concerned jurisdiction who shall visit the sites as referred above. They would be competent to call any respective authority to restore and preserve the dignity as well antiquity value of ancient property as referred above within their territorial jurisdiction. Besides, Deputy Commissioners shall also visit ancient properties in their respective areas on quarterly basis and ensue that same remain alongwith Antiquities Department and no damage / loss is caused to such properties. Secretary shall submit detail report regarding creation of endowment fund and restoration of referred properties in their original form. Needless to mention that Mohatta Palace (ancient monument) matter is subjudice in another proceeding therefore this order will not prejudice those proceedings.

12. With regard to subject matter property defendant No.2 shall hear the plaintiff and pass appropriate order in accordance with law within three months.

To come up after three months. Office shall fix this matter before same bench as it is a part heard matter. Learned MIT-II shall ensure compliance of this order.

I

JUDGE